# Fail Safe <br> CEO Compensation in Canada 

David Macdonald



## C C P A

CANADIAN CENTRE
for POLICY ALTERNATIVES
CENTRE CANADIEN de POLITIQUES ALTERNATIVES

## ISBN 978-1-77125-481-6

This report is available free of charge at www. policyalternatives.ca. Printed copies may be ordered through the CCPA National Office for $\$ 10$.

PLEASE MAKE A DONATION...
Help us to continue to offer our publications free online.

With your support we can continue to produce high quality research - and make sure it gets into the hands of citizens, journalists, policy makers and progressive organizations. Visit www.policyalternatives.ca or call 613-563-1341 for more information.

The CCPA is an independent policy research organization. This report has been subjected to peer review and meets the research standards of the Centre.

The opinions and recommendations in this report, and any errors, are those of the authors, and do not necessarily reflect the views of the funders of this report.

## ABOUT THE AUTHOR

David Macdonald is a senior economist at the CCPA.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author would like to thank Elliot Setzer and Matthew Polacko for their invaluable research assistance, as well as Toby Heaps and Corporate Knights staff for their help with data collection. Thanks also to Alex Hemingway, Hugh Mackenzie, Toby Sanger and Katherine Scott for their comments on an earlier draft. The author is especially grateful to Mary Neumann for her financial support of this project.

4 CEO Pay: By the Numbers
5 Results
9 Composition and Taxation of CEO Pay
12 C-suite Payrolls and Company Performance
15 Conclusion
17 Appendix: Canada's Richest 100 CEOs
22 Notes

## CEO Pay: By the Numbers

## January 2, 10:09 a.m.

Time at which the average top-100 CEO has made as much money as the average Canadian worker will make all year (based on 2018 corporate compensation data).

## \$11.8 million

Average pay of the top 100 highest-paid CEOs in 2018, beating 2016's record of $\$ 10.4$ million.

## \$52,061

Average individual income in Canada in 2018, up from $\$ 50,744$ the year before.

## 227:1

Ratio of average CEO pay to average worker compensation in 2018, representing the worst inequality in pay that we have recorded over 13 years of producing this report.

79\%
Portion of CEO pay in 2018 that came from bonuses related to their company's stock price.
13\%
Proportion of profitable companies in our study who paid more to their top five executives, including the CEO, than they paid in income tax in 2018.

4
Number of women in the top 100 highest-paid CEOs, up one from 2017.
61\%
Pay hike for a top-100 CEO between 2008 and 2018. The average-income worker saw their salary go up by $24 \%$ over this same period.

## \$6.1 million/year

"Minimum wage" of a top-100 CEO in 2018. In 2008 and 2009, a CEO needed half that (\$3 million a year) to make the list.

## 9

Number of money-losing TSX/S\&P Composite companies whose c-suite payroll was at least $40 \%$ of their total loss.

## Results

THE CANADIAN CENTRE FOR POLICY ALTERNATIVES has been tracking executive pay at Canada's largest companies for 13 years now as part of our ongoing research into income and wealth inequality in Canada. ${ }^{1}$

Every year, we comb through the filings of the 250 publicly traded companies on the S\&P/TSX Composite Index - data that becomes available each summer in company proxy circulars from the previous year provided to the System for Electronic Document Analysis and Retrieval (SEDAR) ${ }^{2}$ - to determine the average compensation of the top 100 highest-paid CEOs. We then compare their pay to the average working income in Canada.

The difference between top CEO incomes and the average Canadian income is a good indicator of income inequality. As shown in Figure 1, that pay gap has been growing since we started this research. In 2018, the last year for which we have SEDAR data, Canada's average top-100 chief executive made a record $\$ 11.8$ million, or 227 times the annual average individual income in Canada. The previous record was set in 2016, when the average CEO income hit \$10.4 million.

Put another way, by 10:09 a.m. on January 2, the average highest-paid CEO in Canada will have taken home the average worker's whole salary for the year. That's half an hour earlier than the previous (2016) record time of 10:57 a.m. In 2011 or 2012, it would have taken the average CEO until after lunch (about 1 p.m.) on the first working day of the year to earn a full year's average individual income. Now they've done it by the time many people are pouring their second cup of coffee.


Source Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, company proxy circulars, Statistics Canada Table 14-10-0204-01 and author's calculations.

The pay gap is a result of top CEO incomes rising faster than average incomes across Canada. The average compensation of the richest CEOs was $\$ 1.8$ million higher in 2018 than in 2017 - an $18 \%$ jump. The average worker, on the other hand, saw their pay go up by $\$ 1,302$ in 2018 - from $\$ 50,744$ to $\$ 52,061$ - representing a $2.6 \%$ pay hike. ${ }^{3}$ Subtract inflation of $2.3 \%$ that year, and the real average income increased by a paltry $\$ 150.4$

Since 2008, more or less in line with inflation, average worker pay has risen $24 \%$ while top-100 CEO pay has grown more by $61 \%$. Canada's relatively low unemployment rate of $5.9 \%$ does not appear to be putting any upward pressure on average incomes. ${ }^{5}$ Economic growth over this period, however, is going to pad corporate profits, with some of those spoils paying for rising executive salaries.

The significant increases in executive compensation recorded in this annual report are not just due to a few highflying CEOs skewing the average income at the top end. In fact, our research has uncovered regular increases in the "minimum wage" CEOs need to make to get on the top-100 list to begin with (see Figure 2).

In 2008 and 2009, a CEO would have had to make just over \$3 million to be included in this report. This year, that amount is double: the minimum

## A CEO Gender Lens

A gender lens reveals the richest CEOs list is, as always, a "boy's club". Only four women are among Canada's richest 100 CEOs, up from three last year. This may seem like progress, but it really isn't as women performed as well as men named John or men named Jay, there are four of each on the list. Women did outperform men named Paul though, of which there were only three on the list this year.
figure 2 Minimum Wage of a Top-100 CEO (2008-2018)


Source Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, company proxy circulars and author's calculations.
top-100 CEO income is now over $\$ 6$ million. For the record, there were four women in this year's top-100 list compared to three last year.

One of the arguments for outrageous CEO pay is that companies compete for their CEOs and if they aren't paid enough, the CEOs will move to a higher paying company. This year, we examined how CEOs got to the CEO chair and how long they had been with the company. In fact, $75 \%$ of richest CEOs were promoted to that chair after holding a lower position at the company. It is fairly unusual for CEOs to be hired directly into the CEO position, even at average pay levels of $\$ 11.8$ million. Instead they rise up through the
company ranks. In 2018, the CEOs who rose up through the ranks were at their companies an average of 18 years.

It shouldn't be terribly surprising that company leaders are those who've worked there and best understand it. The evidence directly contradicts the idea that CEOs are routinely head-hunted away and the only firewall to losing one's CEO is endlessly higher pay.

# Composition and Taxation of CEO Pay 

OUTSIDE OF YEAR-END bonuses or sales commissions, most people receive almost all of their annual pay in wages or salaries. For top CEOs, base salaries make up a relatively small share of overall compensation, with the rest paid out in the form of company stock (or options to buy more of it in the future) and other cash bonuses related to stock prices.

As shown in Figure 3, only 10\% of top-100 CEO pay came from a salary in 2018, down from $14 \%$ in 2008. Another $8 \%$ of their pay was in the form of super-charged pensions worth on average $\$ 1.3$ million a year in retirement. ${ }^{6}$

If we subtract out base salary, pension and other compensation, we can see that an average of $79 \%$ of CEO pay comes from bonuses that are almost always tied to the company's stock price. As stocks rise, the value of all these bonuses goes up. When the stock price falls, so does the CEO's income, but not by much. Complicated formulas virtually guarantee that CEOs get almost all their variable pay irrespective of their company's stock performance. These and other factors make stock-based compensation difficult to rationalize.

First, CEOs cannot control the price of company stock. A bull run might pull a stock up even if the company is not doing great. Or, the stock could be dragged down, along with those of competitors in the same sector, by events unrelated to performance. U.S. sanctions against Iran might drive up the price of oil, for example, which would increase the stock prices of Can-
figure 3 Breakdown Top-100 CEO Compensation, 2018


Source Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, company proxy circulars, and author's calculations.
adian oil sands companies even as production falters. CEOs didn't cause these events to happen, yet almost four quarters of their income somehow depends on them and other short-term impacts on stock prices.

The place of stock options in overall CEO pay is also important to note. Currently, CEOs pay tax on only $50 \%$ of the value of stock option-based compensation. The vast majority of working Canadians, on the other hand, pay tax on every dollar they make in wages or salaries. It's no wonder the socalled stock option deduction has grown increasingly controversial, with the Liberal government promising to make reforms in the near future.

The use of stock options as a portion of CEO pay dropped between 2013 and 2014, as shown in Figure 4. Levels stayed relatively low for the next two years, possibly in response to the Liberal's 2015 election platform promise - net yet kept - to close the stock option tax loophole if elected to government. The 2019 federal budget committed to cap the stock option deduction rather than cancel it outright. ${ }^{7}$

When stock options declined as a share of overall CEO pay in 2014, the share of straight shares went up. But by 2018, being paid in shares had also fallen out of favour, to be replaced by cash bonuses, which represented $43 \%$ of total CEO compensation.

## FIGURE 4 Composition of CEO Pay by Type Since 2018



Source CCPA CEO reports, company proxy circulars and author's calculations.

Regardless of the mix, the government could address excessive CEO compensation through tax reform. On top of ending preferential taxation of stock options, the federal government could:

- eliminate the dividend gross-up and tax credit, which credits shareholders (including company CEOs) on their personal tax return for taxes paid on company profits;
- eliminate the partial inclusion of capital gains, which taxes profits from the sale of stock or property at $50 \%$ the normal income tax rate; and
- significantly increase income taxes on extremely high salaries.

All of these tax reforms were recommended in the 2019 Alternative Federal Budget and many have been taken up as priorities for this government and by federal opposition parties.

# C-suite Payrolls and Company Performance 

excessive corporate pay isn't limited to the CEO chair but extends through other top positions at major companies. For the first time, this report collected compensation data for so-called named executive officers - Chief Financial Officers, Chief Operations Officers, etc. - and compared it to company performance and income taxes paid. ${ }^{8}$ The results were enlightening.

We found that in some cases, executive (C-suite) payrolls have become so large that they are a major factor in company losses. Among profitable companies, C-suite compensation can exceed the value of a company's income tax payments.

Unlike personal income taxes, corporate income taxes can be negative if a company has lost money that fiscal year. In that situation, a company can retroactively apply its losses to previous, profitable years going back a maximum of 20 years, in which case the federal government reimburses the company for its net losses in the current tax year.

Since it would be unfair to judge a company's performance on one year's worth of profits or losses, the values in Table 1 are a five-year average. We also use the cash value of income taxes paid to better reflect the amount companies actually paid, on average, between 2014 and 2018. ${ }^{9}$

We found that of the 134 companies on the TSX/S\&P Composite Index with market capitalization above $\$ 2$ billion, ${ }^{10} 26$ lost money over the 2014-18

## table 1 C-suite Payroll (2018) vs. Average Pre-tax Losses (2014-2018) \$mil CDN

| Company | $\begin{array}{r} \text { C-suite Payroll } \\ \text { (2018) } \end{array}$ | Avg Income Taxes Paid (Received) (2018-2014) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Avg Pre-tax Loss } \\ & (2018-2014) \end{aligned}$ | C-suite Payroll as Proportion of Loss | C-suite Payroll Decile (10=top) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| SSR Mining Inc | \$9 | \$11 | -\$7 | 125\% | 2 |
| Altagas Ltd | \$22 | \$29 | -\$28 | 80\% | 8 |
| Shopify Inc. Class A | \$36 | \$0 | -\$46 | 79\% | 10 |
| Pretium Resources Inc | \$10 | -\$1 | -\$14 | 71\% | 3 |
| Cott Corp | \$16 | \$5 | -\$23 | 71\% | 6 |
| Canopy Growth Corp | \$10 | \$0 | -\$16 | 62\% | 3 |
| Endeavour Mining Corp | \$20 | \$17 | -\$43 | 47\% | 7 |
| Blackberry Ltd | \$146 | -\$122 | -\$352 | 42\% | 10 |
| Husky Energy Inc | \$19 | \$176 | -\$57 | 34\% | 7 |
| Iamgold Corp | \$11 | \$36 | -\$43 | 25\% | 4 |
| Enerplus Corp | \$11 | -\$5 | -\$59 | 19\% | 4 |
| Gibson Energy Inc | \$13 | \$24 | -\$76 | 18\% | 5 |
| B2Gold Corp | \$19 | \$31 | -\$116 | 17\% | 7 |
| Cameco Corp | \$15 | \$105 | -\$104 | 15\% | 6 |
| Cenovus Energy Inc | \$21 | \$224 | -\$156 | 13\% | 7 |
| Barrick Gold Corp | \$29 | \$589 | -\$262 | 11\% | 9 |
| Pan American Silver Corp | \$10 | \$47 | -\$98 | 10\% | 3 |
| Empire Co Ltd Class A | \$18 | \$91 | -\$191 | 9\% | 7 |
| Kinross Gold Corp | \$14 | \$191 | -\$384 | 4\% | 5 |
| Encana Corp | \$24 | -\$106 | -\$769 | 3\% | 8 |
| Crescent Point Energy Corp | \$34 | \$0.1 | -\$1,105 | 3\% | 9 |
| Bombardier Inc Class B | \$30 | \$130 | -\$1,709 | 2\% | 9 |
| Bausch Health Companies Inc | \$31 | \$168 | -\$1,981 | 2\% | 9 |
| Yamana Gold Inc | \$13 | \$73 | -\$1,024 | 1\% | 5 |
| Onex Corp | \$3 | \$253 | -\$886 | 0\% | 1 |
| Goldcorp Inc | \$0 | \$165 | -\$2,892 | 0\% | 1 |

Source Company proxy circulars, annual reports and author's calculations. Income taxes paid are cash income taxes paid.
period. For a third of these 26 companies, C-suite payroll in 2018 cost at least $40 \%$ of the average pre-tax losses over the previous five years.

Shopify, for example, pays its executives an eyewatering $\$ 36$ million a year, yet its average loss over the past five years was $\$ 46$ million. Blackberry's C-suite is the most expensive on the TSX/S\&P Composite Index, even while its average losses over the past five years amount to $\$ 352$ million a year. We

## table 2 C-suite Payroll (2018) vs. Average Income Taxes Paid (2014-2018) \$mil CDN

| Company | C-suite Payroll | Avg Income Taxes Paid (Received) (2018-2014) | Avg Pre-tax Profit (2018-2014) | C-suite Payroll Decile (10=top) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Element Fleet Management Corp | \$44 | \$26 | \$15 | 10 |
| Air Canada | \$25 | \$6 | \$594 | 8 |
| Hydro One Ltd | \$21 | \$20 | \$836 | 7 |
| Canadian Natural Resources Ltd | \$18 | -\$125 | \$1,966 | 7 |
| Gildan Activewear Inc | \$18 | \$12 | \$458 | 6 |
| Algonquin Power \& Utilities Corp | \$14 | \$8 | \$128 | 5 |
| Maple Leaf Foods Inc | \$12 | \$7 | \$74 | 4 |
| Wheaton Precious Metals Corp | \$11 | \$1 | \$164 | 4 |
| PrairieSky Royalty Ltd | \$9 | \$9 | \$99 | 3 |
| Seven Generations Energy Ltd | \$9 | \$1 | \$293 | 3 |
| Capital Power Corp | \$9 | \$5 | \$181 | 2 |
| Ivanhoe Mines Ltd | \$7 | \$0 | \$180 | 2 |
| OceanaGold Corp | \$7 | \$2 | \$160 | 1 |
| Descartes Systems Group Inc | \$6 | \$4 | \$33 | 1 |

Source Company proxy circulars, annual reports and author's calculations. Income taxes paid are cash income taxes paid.
make no judgment as to why these and the other firms in Table 1 are not profitable, but the numbers do significantly undercut the idea that C-suite compensation is based on performance.

Of the remaining $108 \mathrm{~S} \mathrm{\& P} / \mathrm{TSX}$ Composite Index companies that made money on average over the past five years, 14 paid their executives more than they paid in income taxes on average over the same period. Put another way, $13 \%$ of profitable companies on the index paid more to their C-suite than they paid in corporate income taxes. In some cases, companies managed to get governments to pay them back their past income taxes despite being profitable. Air Canada, Maple Leaf Foods and Hydro One are among those firms that paid more to their C-suite executives than what they paid in corporate income taxes averaged over the past five years.

## Conclusion

THE VAST GAP between excessive CEO compensation and average incomes in Canada is growing larger and more difficult to rationalize with each passing year. Canadian companies are earning money and seeing profits, even in this period of relatively slow growth, but that money is not reaching workers. Instead, wealth continues to concentrate at the very top while average incomes are barely keeping up with inflation.

The Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives has long called for tax reform as one, relatively simple means of correcting gross imbalances in income in Canada. Government promises to close the stock option deduction, which appear to have affected the composition of CEO pay, have not yet been met. In any case, companies can merely shift what they would have paid their CEOs in stock options to pure stock or cash bonuses instead, which can come with additional tax perks that keep overall compensation in the stratosphere.

During the last election, the NDP and Green Party advocated restricting another expensive tax loophole - the partial inclusion of capital gains - to help reduce the massive gap between top and average incomes. The $2019 \mathrm{Al}-$ ternative Federal Budget estimated that closing the entire list of tax loopholes benefiting exclusively Canada's wealthiest people would raise $\$ 18$ billion a year - money that could be put toward a national pharmacare program, free post-secondary tuition or national child care. ${ }^{11}$

Restricting the tax incentives for executive pay is also possible on the corporate side. Canada should follow the United States in not allowing com-
panies to write off compensation totalling more than $\$ 1$ million for any particularly employee on their corporate taxes. All payments over $\$ 1$ million in whatever form should be taxable at the applicable corporate income tax rate. The million-dollar mark is roughly the average base salary for the richest CEOs, which sat at $\$ 1.2$ million in 2018. Even at this high threshold, most C-suite executives would be excluded.

The longer-term solution to extreme CEO compensation will lie in a more thorough reform of the tax system that doesn't just target single items like tax loopholes, but which updates the entire system with the intention of fighting inequality. Executive pay is reaching an extreme point where it can be a risk even to company profitability. And total C-suite pay can exceed total corporate income taxes paid by some companies - a situation made possible by declining corporate tax rates and increasing executive pay.

While limiting CEO pay is important, so is addressing wage gains for the average worker. Unemployment has been below 7\% since September 2014, a relatively low amount for Canada that should be putting more upward pressure on salaries and wages than we've seen. Wage gains since June 2019 are promisingly high, but they are small consolation for workers who continue to see the spoils of their labour go to pad already bloated CEO and C-suite incomes. ${ }^{12}$

## Appendix

## table 3 Canada's Richest 100 CEOs (2018 \$CDN)

| Name | Company | Position | Salary | Share-based Awards | Optionbased Awards | Non-equity Incentive Plan Compensation | Pension Value | All Other Compensation | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Total } \\ \text { Compensation } \\ 2018 \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| John Chen * | Blackberry Ltd | Executive Chair and Chief Executive Officer | 1,295,700 | 137,732,910 | - | 2,936,315 | - | 17,816 | 141,982,741 |
| Helena Foulkes | Hudson's Bay Co | Chief Executive Officer | 1,555,014 | 19,590,923 | 1,672,059 | 5,735,911 | 119,570 | 749,008 | 29,422,486 |
| Donald J. Walker * | Magna International Inc | Chief Executive Officer | 421,103 | 9,251,298 | 6,167,532 | 10,011,874 | - | 156,780 | 26,008,586 |
| Jochen Tilk * | Nutrien Ltd | Executive Chair | 891,766 | 2,796,388 | 2,796,388 | 2,521,260 | 203,828 | 16,782,793 | 25,992,421 |
| Daniel Schwartz * | Restaurant Brands Intl Inc | CEO | 1,036,560 | 21,171,055 | - | 2,016,510 | - | 112,848 | 24,336,974 |
| Joseph C. Papa * | Bausch Health Companies Inc | Chief Executive Officer | 1,943,550 | 9,516,822 | 2,591,031 | 4,926,899 | - | 121,677 | 19,099,978 |
| James C. Smith * | Thomson-Reuters Corp | President and Chief Executive Officer | 2,073,120 | 5,701,099 | 5,701,084 | 5,363,576 | $(119,204)$ | 48,681 | 18,768,356 |
| Scott Saxberg | Crescent Point Energy Corp | Former President and Chief Executive Officer | 387,563 | 1,851,042 | 1,053,000 | - | - | 15,314,874 | 18,606,479 |
| Ronald J. Mittelstaedt * | Waste Connections Inc | Chief Executive Officer and Chairman | 1,226,559 | 14,602,245 | - | 1,852,851 | - | 59,436 | 17,741,091 |
| Chuck Magro * | Nutrien Ltd | President \& CEO | 1,600,000 | 4,968,850 | 4,968,867 | 4,412,800 | 700,883 | 49,984 | 16,701,385 |
| John L. Thornton * | Barrick Gold Corp | Executive Chairman | 3,239,250 | - | - | 12,613,640 | 485,888 | 323,917 | 16,662,694 |
| Doug Suttles * | Encana Corp | President \& Chief Executive Officer | 1,425,270 | 8,061,547 | 2,687,181 | 2,966,343 | - | 384,599 | 15,524,940 |
| Linda Hasenfratz | Linamar Corp | Chief Executive Officer | 642,921 | 2,261,484 | - | 11,080,086 | 3,500 | 1,449,073 | 15,437,064 |


| Name | Company | Position | Salary | Share-based Awards | Optionbased Awards | Non-equity Incentive Plan Compensation | Pension Value | All Other Compensation | Total Compensation 2018 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Bharat Masrani | Toronto Dominion Bank | Group President and Chief Executive Officer, TD Bank Group | 1,334,988 | 5,571,720 | 4,644,337 | 2,079,000 | 1,596,800 | 89,220 | 15,316,065 |
| Steven W. Williams | Suncor Energy Inc | Chief Executive Officer | 1,465,577 | 5,065,942 | 4,933,692 | 3,061,000 | 100,800 | 162,396 | 14,789,407 |
| David McKay | Royal Bank Of Canada | President and chief executive officer | 1,500,000 | 7,095,040 | 1,773,760 | 3,175,300 | 901,000 | 44,877 | 14,489,977 |
| Serge Godin | CGI Group Inc Class A | Founder and Executive Chairman of the Board | 1,375,000 | 10,596,113 | - | 1,848,643 | - | 55,397 | 13,875,153 |
| Alain Bellemare * | Bombardier Inc Class B | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,447,038 | 3,600,621 | 3,600,621 | 3,665,406 | 26,562 | 1,434,210 | 13,774,457 |
| Bradley Nullmeyer | Element Fleet <br> Management Corp | Former Chief Executive Officer | 91,146 | - | - | - | - | 13,223,691 | 13,314,837 |
| Robert A. Mionis * | Celestica Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,230,915 | 9,329,040 | - | 1,169,369 | 171,827 | 1,362,026 | 13,263,177 |
| Brian J. Porter | Bank Of Nova Scotia | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,200,000 | 6,000,000 | 1,500,000 | 2,500,000 | 2,048,000 | 2,990 | 13,250,990 |
| Roy Gori | Manulife Financial Corp | President and CEO | 1,423,033 | 4,592,515 | 1,968,221 | 4,097,602 | 644,300 | 260,673 | 12,986,344 |
| Frank Hasenfratz | Linamar Corp | Chairman of the Board | 446,064 | - | - | 11,031,959 | - | 1,424,463 | 12,902,486 |
| R. Jeffrey Orr | Power Financial Corp | President and Chief Executive Officer | 4,661,000 | 2,761,870 | 2,546,250 | - | 2,150,000 | 480,952 | 12,600,072 |
| Darren Entwistle | Telus Corp | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,375,000 | 9,644,535 | - | 669,798 | 742,000 | 131,883 | 12,563,216 |
| Russell Girling | TC Energy Corp | President \& CEO | 1,362,508 | 3,800,000 | 3,800,000 | 2,406,264 | 1,120,000 | 13,625 | 12,502,397 |
| Keith E. Creel | Canadian Pacific Railway Ltd | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,453,595 | 4,369,757 | 2,519,163 | 3,148,551 | 452,209 | 543,332 | 12,486,607 |
| Al Monaco * | Enbridge Inc | President \& Chief Executive Officer | 1,403,571 | 4,212,154 | 2,634,995 | 3,295,305 | 737,253 | 64,995 | 12,348,272 |
| Sean Boyd * | Agnico-Eagle Mines Ltd | Vice-Chairman and Chief Executive Officer | 1,750,717 | 5,815,384 | - | 4,181,714 | 549,125 | 25,524 | 12,322,463 |
| N. Murray Edwards | Ensign Energy Services Inc/Canadian Natural Resources Ltd | Chairman/Executive Chair | 1 | 503,800 | 2,799,950 | 8,369,275 | - | 425,432 | 12,098,458 |
| George A. Cope | BCE Inc | President and CEO, BCE and Bell Canada | 1,400,000 | 5,156,250 | 1,718,750 | 2,814,000 | 756,840 | 168,602 | 12,014,442 |
| Stephen G. Wetmore | Canadian Tire Corp Class A | President and CEO | 1,500,000 | 8,999,545 | - | 1,063,762 | - | 361,181 | 11,924,488 |
| Calin Rovinescu | Air Canada | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,400,000 | 2,800,000 | 2,800,000 | 3,524,850 | 1,027,000 | - | 11,551,850 |
| Joe Natale | Rogers Communications Class B | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,270,865 | 3,750,158 | 3,750,013 | 1,963,487 | 684,217 | 130,853 | 11,549,593 |
| Tobias Lutke * | Shopify Inc. Class A | CEO | 759,798 | 5,182,924 | 5,183,430 | - | - | - | 11,126,153 |
| Jim Jarrell | Linamar Corp | President \& Chief Operating Officer | 499,600 | - | 2,171,000 | 7,404,037 | 3,500 | 1,003,992 | 11,082,129 |
| Donald R. Lindsay | Teck Resources Ltd | President and CEO | 1,607,500 | 2,967,500 | 2,973,500 | 2,466,300 | 695,000 | - | 10,709,800 |
| Mark S. Little | Suncor Energy Inc | President and Chief Operating Officer | 915,000 | 2,579,400 | 2,512,063 | 1,450,000 | 2,996,300 | 68,700 | 10,521,463 |
| Glenn J. Chamandy * | Gildan Activewear Inc | President and CEO | 1,554,840 | 6,219,347 | - | 2,332,260 | 72,987 | 144,582 | 10,324,016 |


| Name | Company | Position | Salary | Share-based Awards | Optionbased Awards | Non-equity Incentive Plan Compensation | Pension Value | All Other Compensation | Total Compensation 2018 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Darryl White | Bank Of Montreal | Chief Executive Officer | 1,000,000 | 4,506,250 | 1,158,750 | 1,980,000 | 1,476,234 | 3,000 | 10,124,234 |
| Victor Dodig | Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce | CEO | 1,000,000 | 5,115,661 | 1,278,915 | 2,131,524 | 520,000 | 2,250 | 10,048,350 |
| Luc Jobin | Canadian National Railway Co | Former President and Chief Executive Officer | 348,219 | 4,263,432 | 2,700,480 | - | 340,546 | 2,098,534 | 9,751,211 |
| Daniel Jauernig | Element Fleet Management Corp | Former Acting Chief Executive Officer | 421,166 | 1,083,000 | 361,093 | - | - | 7,851,078 | 9,716,337 |
| Dean A. Connor | Sun Life Financial Inc | President \& Chief Executive Officer | 1,100,000 | 4,500,028 | 1,500,001 | 2,200,000 | 400,833 | 11,997 | 9,712,859 |
| Irwin D. Simon | Aphria Inc. | Interim CEO | 397,201 | 901,500 | 7,953,595 | 325,000 | - | - | 9,577,296 |
| Brian McManus | Stella-Jones Inc | President and CEO | 750,000 | 7,592,000 | - | 1,200,000 | - | 13,250 | 9,555,250 |
| Mark J. Barrenechea * | Open Text Corp | Vice Chair, Chief Executive Officer and Chief Technology Officer | 1,230,915 | 4,585,434 | 1,823,770 | 1,569,417 | - | 48,150 | 9,257,686 |
| Barry V. Perry | Fortis Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,300,000 | 3,900,000 | 1,300,000 | 1,713,000 | 460,750 | 406,730 | 9,080,480 |
| Jerry Fowden * | Cott Corp | Executive Chairman and former Chief Executive Officer | 1,210,937 | 6,202,614 | 490,746 | 1,101,951 | - | 37,076 | 9,043,325 |
| Jay S. Hennick * | Colliers International/ FirstService Corp | Chairman and Chief Executive Officer/Founder and Chairman | 2,307,123 | - | - | 6,640,107 | - | - | 8,946,631 |
| Louis Vachon | National Bank Canada | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,125,015 | 3,375,000 | 1,687,503 | 1,890,000 | 788,000 | 4,768 | 8,870,286 |
| John Floren | Methanex Corp | President \& CEO | 1,148,750 | 2,177,130 | 2,159,404 | 2,770,000 | 277,997 | 319,122 | 8,852,403 |
| José Boisjoli | BRP Inc | President and CEO | 1,067,093 | - | 4,495,284 | 2,384,953 | 839,000 | 1,167 | 8,787,497 |
| Brian Hannasch | Alimentation CoucheTard Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,748,260 | 3,205,878 | 1,386,906 | 1,704,553 | 723,294 | - | 8,768,991 |
| Mark Davis | Chemtrade Logistics Income Fund | CEO | 839,167 | 6,250,000 | - | 1,185,000 | 350,000 | 64,215 | 8,688,382 |
| George D. Schindler | CGI Group Inc Class A | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,210,938 | 2,797,802 | 2,508,117 | 1,947,121 | 3,209 | 100,950 | 8,568,137 |
| Rafael Ashkenazi * | Stars Group Inc | Director and Chief Executive Officer of The Stars Group and Chief Executive Officer of Stars Interactive Group | 1,287,518 | 3,224,666 | - | 3,856,978 | - | 187,642 | 8,556,802 |
| Charles Brindamour | Intact Financial Corp | Chief Executive Officer | 1,229,423 | 5,227,500 | - | 1,584,009 | 475,910 | - | 8,516,842 |
| Jean-Jacques Ruest | Canadian National Railway Co | President and Chief Executive Officer | 873,383 | 2,508,845 | 2,052,555 | 1,577,598 | 1,449,000 | 24,034 | 8,485,415 |
| Alain Bédard | TFI International Inc | President and CEO | 1,703,846 | 922,078 | 922,078 | 3,962,107 | 553,200 | 105,162 | 8,168,470 |
| Sébastien de Montessus | Endeavour Mining Corp | CEO and President | 1,230,915 | 3,681,101 | - | 1,846,373 | - | 1,389,475 | 8,147,863 |
| Henry Buckley | Uni-Select Inc | Former President and Chief Executive Officer | 679,949 | 519,660 | 519,660 | - | 82,206 | 6,338,809 | 8,140,284 |
| J. Paul Rollinson * | Kinross Gold Corp | President and CEO | 1,329,647 | 3,084,783 | 771,195 | 1,902,726 | 598,341 | 291,071 | 7,977,765 |
| Galen G. Weston | George Weston Ltd | Chairman and CEO of the Corporation | 1,180,000 | 3,146,744 | 1,573,339 | 1,963,063 | - | 65,409 | 7,928,555 |
| Robert J. Peabody | Husky Energy Inc | President \& Chief Executive Officer | 1,528,750 | 3,431,528 | 846,703 | 1,738,000 | 168,163 | 171,132 | 7,884,275 |
| Richard Kruger | Imperial Oil Ltd | Chairman, president and chief executive officer | 1,164,834 | 3,800,610 | - | 1,359,844 | $(1,254,381)$ | 2,799,146 | 7,870,053 |


| Name | Company | Position | Salary | Share-based Awards | Optionbased Awards | Non-equity Incentive Plan Compensation | Pension Value | All Other Compensation | Total Compensation 2018 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| André Desmarais | Power Corp of Canada <br> / Power Financial Corp | Deputy Chairman, President and Co-Chief Executive Officer | 1,225,000 | 277,513 | 4,451,260 | 1,500,000 | $(336,000)$ | 642,638 | 7,760,412 |
| Bradley Shaw | Shaw Communications <br> Inc Class B | Chief Executive Officer | 2,000,000 | 974,050 | 133,200 | 3,896,200 | $(180,500)$ | 751,223 | 7,574,173 |
| Clive Johnson | B2Gold Corp | President and CEO | 1,200,000 | 2,700,000 | - | 3,600,000 | - | 5,450 | 7,505,450 |
| François Olivier | Transcontinental Inc Class A | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,035,869 | 3,118,211 | - | 2,441,940 | 182,044 | 502,074 | 7,280,137 |
| Jeffrey R. Carney | IGM Financial Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer, IGM Financial and IG Wealth Management | 1,254,667 | 1,132,500 | 1,575,765 | 2,843,485 | 320,100 | 134,845 | 7,261,362 |
| Jay Mehr | Shaw Communications Inc Class B | President | 1,320,000 | 575,575 | 111,000 | 2,302,300 | 2,854,500 | 80,554 | 7,243,929 |
| Paul Desmarais Jr. | Power Corp of Canada <br> / Power Financial Corp | Chairman and Co-Chief Executive Officer | 1,225,000 | 278,125 | 4,451,260 | 1,500,000 | $(732,000)$ | 507,249 | 7,229,635 |
| Tim S. McKay | Canadian Natural Resources Ltd | President | 583,334 | - | 2,236,875 | 4,319,179 | - | 78,820 | 7,218,208 |
| Paul Conibear * | Lundin Mining Corp | Former CEO | 723,860 | - | - | - | - | 6,442,569 | 7,166,429 |
| Jorge Ganoza Durant * | Fortuna Silver Mines Inc | CEO | 777,420 | 4,060,724 | 590,839 | 567,517 | - | 1,165,927 | 7,162,426 |
| Michael Dilger | Pembina Pipeline Corp | President and CEO | 1,029,167 | 2,205,000 | 1,470,000 | 1,944,600 | 413,133 | 69,303 | 7,131,203 |
| Paul Mahon | Great-West Lifeco Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer of Lifeco, Great-West Life, London Life, CLFC and Canada Life | 1,223,400 | 3,064,881 | 911,934 | 1,770,000 | $(69,286)$ | 215,486 | 7,116,415 |
| JR Shaw | Shaw Communications Inc Class B | Executive Chair | 1,200,000 | - | - | 7,311,150 | $(1,758,000)$ | 293,390 | 7,046,540 |
| Larry Richman | Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce | Group Head, US Region, President and CEO, CIBC Bank USA | 1,326,640 | 3,071,715 | 767,929 | 1,645,562 | 209,000 | 10,594 | 7,031,440 |
| Marc Parent | CAE Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer | 961,200 | 2,370,416 | 1,126,080 | 1,695,370 | 596,000 | 175,114 | 6,924,180 |
| Jason W. Cohenour * | Sierra Wireless Inc | Former President and Chief Executive Officer | 361,469 | 1,543,666 | - | 170,762 | - | 4,840,752 | 6,916,649 |
| Tim Gitzel | Cameco Corp | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,025,000 | 2,183,062 | 1,455,454 | 1,784,000 | 318,300 | - | 6,765,816 |
| Edward Sonshine | Riocan Reit | CEO | 1,300,000 | 2,600,000 | - | 1,806,961 | - | 1,000,000 | 6,706,961 |
| Michael H. McCain | Maple Leaf Foods Inc | President and CEO | 1,137,412 | 2,370,165 | 2,369,774 | 489,081 | 310,778 | - | 6,677,209 |
| Kevin A. Neveu | Precision Drilling Corp | President and CEO | 1,037,280 | 2,750,701 | 1,244,719 | 1,439,019 | - | 199,330 | 6,671,049 |
| Peter Marrone * | Yamana Gold Inc | Executive Chairman | 2,010,040 | 777,420 | - | 2,826,009 | 725,407 | 317,475 | 6,656,352 |
| Eric R. La Flèche | Metro Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer | 932,212 | 1,491,638 | 899,758 | 1,025,733 | 2,226,000 | 5,387 | 6,580,728 |
| Alexander J. Pourbaix | Cenovus Energy Inc | President \& Chief Executive Officer | 1,000,000 | 2,249,993 | 2,250,000 | 880,000 | 82,667 | 95,825 | 6,558,485 |
| Alexandre L'Heureux | WSP Global Inc | President and CEO | 1,100,000 | 2,419,935 | 604,995 | 2,126,300 | - | 291,000 | 6,542,230 |
| Ravi Saligram * | Ritchie Bros Auctioneers Inc | Chief Executive Officer | 1,295,700 | 1,778,245 | 1,758,674 | 1,474,999 | - | 224,639 | 6,532,257 |


| Name | Company | Position | Salary | Share-based Awards | Optionbased Awards | Non-equity Incentive Plan Compensation | Pension Value | All Other Compensation | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Total } \\ \text { Compensation } \\ 2018 \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| J. Bruce Flatt * | Brookfield Asset Management Inc | Managing Partner and CEO | 971,775 | - | 5,354,869 | - | - | 48,589 | 6,375,233 |
| John G. Reid | Russel Metals Inc | President and CEO | 959,934 | 2,479,754 | 340,533 | 2,140,021 | 12,702 | 416,550 | 6,349,494 |
| Barry McInerney | IGM Financial Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer, Mackenzie Investments | 1,045,667 | 891,750 | 594,261 | 2,275,120 | 235,800 | 1,259,228 | 6,301,826 |
| Anthony Marino | Vermilion Energy Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer | 668,221 | 4,999,880 | - | 500,000 | - | 77,534 | 6,245,635 |
| Rod N. Baker | Great Canadian Gaming Corp | President and Chief Executive Officer | 776,923 | 954,558 | 3,678,782 | 776,923 | 13,250 | 1,855 | 6,202,291 |
| Dawn L. Farrell | Transalta Corp | President and Chief Executive Officer | 1,000,000 | 1,760,000 | 440,000 | 1,570,000 | 1,320,900 | 84,714 | 6,175,614 |
| Scott Balfour | Emera Inc | President and Chief Executive Officer | 986,673 | 2,100,156 | 699,846 | 1,668,000 | 634,000 | 35,993 | 6,124,668 |
| Sarah R. Davis | Loblaw Companies Ltd | President | 900,000 | 2,799,938 | 900,004 | 1,403,719 | 42,500 | 58,884 | 6,105,045 |
| Ammar Al-Joundi * | Agnico-Eagle Mines Ltd | President | 900,369 | 3,822,517 | - | 1,025,421 | 288,869 | 26,524 | 6,063,700 |

* reported in US dollars, but converted to Canadian dollars for consistency.


## Notes

1 The first of CCPA's CEO compensation reports was published in 2006. However, certain comparisons are only possible going back to 2008 because of changes that year in how stock options are valued (from their exercise to their award price) for the purposes of determining CEO pay. This shift to using the Black-Scholes option pricing model provided additional transparency of when options were being awarded, but with the trade-off that the final value of those options at exercise is not included. The exercise price will generally be higher than the award price given that CEOs can choose when to exercise their options.

2 U.S. dollar reporting is converted to Canadian dollars using Bank of Canada average annual rates. For 2018 and 2017, conversion was done using the Bank of Canada's annual exchange rates (U.S. Dollar to Canadian dollar); prior to 2017 we used Statistics Canada Table 10-10-0009-01.

3 Statistics Canada, Table 14-10-0204-01, Average weekly earnings by industry, annual
4 Statistics Canada, Table 18-10-0005-01, Consumer Price Index, annual average, not seasonally adjusted.

5 See Statistics Canada. Table 14-10-0106-01 Employment and unemployment rate, annual; Historical Labour Force Statistics, Catalogue 71-201, 1990 Annual.

6 Company 2018 proxy circulars and author's calculations.
7 Government of Canada, Budget 2019: Investing in the Middle Class, pp. 202-205.
8 Metrics were collected from annual company financial filings as provided by SEDAR. The dataset for these metrics was compiled for S\&P/TSX companies with a market capitalization of \$2 billion or more in 2018. A portion of S\&P/TSx companies did not attain the $\$ 2$ billion valuation and so would be eligible to be included in the 100 richest ceos but wouldn't be contained in the key metrics dataset.

9 Cash income taxes paid in annual corporate filings will include almost any form of tax reduction used through tax sheltering, income shifting, tax preferences or rule changes. It also captures deferred tax: income that is not currently included in taxable income but may be at some later date. For use of this approach in academic analysis, see: Scott Dyreng et al., "Changes in Corporate Effective Tax Rates Over the Past Twenty-Five Years," Journal of Financial Economics,

August 25, 2016. For its use in the media, see: New York Times, see New York Times, "Across U.S. Companies, Tax Rates Vary Greatly," May 25, 2013. (https://archive.nytimes.com/www.nytimes. com/interactive/2013/05/25/sunday-review/corporate-taxes.html). A Canadian example can be found in Marco Chown Oved, Toby AA Heaps and MIcheal Yow, The high cost of low corporate taxes, Toronto Star, Dec 14, 2017 (https://projects.thestar.com/canadas-corporations-pay-less-tax-than-you-think/).

10 This includes all named executive officers of all companies on the S\&P/TSX Composite Index. Cash income taxes paid includes all companies from the S\&P/TSx Composite Index with market capitalizations over $\$ 2$ billion on December 2018. As such, there may be additional, smaller companies from the S\&P/Tsx Composite Index where executive payroll exceeds cash income taxes paid that won't be included based on this criterion.

11 Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, Alternative Federal Budget 2019: No time to lose, September 2019.

12 Real year-over-year wage gains for all workers have been $1.7 \%$ or higher between June and October 2019. See: Statistics Canada, Table: 14-10-0320-01: Average usual hours and wages by selected characteristics, monthly, unadjusted for seasonality, last 5 months; and Statistics Canada, Table 18-10-0004-01, Consumer Price Index, monthly, not seasonally adjusted.

